

ROBERT R. HOLZER
New Haven

READYING CAVALLI'S OPERAS FOR THE CLASSROOM:
TEXTBOOKS, EDITIONS, AND THE TEACHING
OF A NON-CANONIC COMPOSER

My title pays homage to a recent volume of essays edited by Ellen Rosand and devoted to the scholarship and performance of Francesco Cavalli's operas.¹ Yet if love of wordplay inspired it, coincidence confirmed it. The volume appeared in print just months after my own foray into editing, albeit of a very different kind. I had been asked to prepare one of the volumes of *The Oxford Anthology of Western Music*, specifically the part that deals with Baroque music.² As its title suggests, the anthology accompanies *The Oxford History of Western Music: College Edition*, the one-volume abridgement of Richard Taruskin's five-volume behemoth prepared by Christopher H. Gibbs.³ I was charged with assembling scores of the works discussed therein and writing commentary on them, based on Taruskin's own in the larger text. While I was left free to do as I pleased with the latter, such was not the case with the former. Thus music after 1700 occupies more pages than that before 1700, and the earlier repertory features some notable lacunae. That one of the biggest is Francesco Cavalli comes as no surprise, for in the course of the more than 3,800 pages of Taruskin's original the composer receives exactly three sentences.

Cavalli scholars are keenly aware of this *lapsus*: Álvaro Torrente noted it in his contribution to the volume cited above.⁴ His survey of the editorial history of Cavalli's operas includes a thoughtful excursus on the role of college textbooks, this under the heading of «how the study of the music has influenced the editions of Cavalli's operas».⁵ As he explains, Cavalli's place at the margins of the canon, which kept his operas from receiving their due from editors,

A version of this article was read at the conference *Cicognini, Cavalli e i viaggi del "Giasone": in rotta verso l'edizione critica*, Università di Bologna, May 13 2014.

¹ *Readying Cavalli's Operas for the Stage: Manuscript, Edition, Production*, ed. by E. Rosand, Farnham, Ashgate, 2013 («Ashgate Interdisciplinary Studies in Opera»).

² *The Oxford Anthology of Western Music, I: The Earliest Notations to the Early Eighteenth Century*, ed. by D. J. Rothenberg and R. R. Holzer, New York - Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2013.

³ R. TARUSKIN - C. H. GIBBS, *The Oxford History of Western Music: College Edition*, New York - Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2013.

⁴ Á. TORRENTE, *Editing Cavalli's Operas: Fashion or Necessity*, in *Readying Cavalli's Operas for the Stage* cit., pp. 17-31: 24.

⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 22.

publishers, and performers, has also kept them out of the pages of *The Oxford History of Western Music* and other textbooks like it.

Following Torrente, I shall attend to two types of textbooks, general surveys intended for music majors – the majority of whom do not become musicologists – and those aimed at non-majors, students for whom no previous knowledge of music is required. Like him, I recognize that these texts are the most problematic, unlike the advanced, period-specific texts that have done Cavalli varying degrees of justice.⁶ These general surveys are big business – those who know the American university system know what a formidable industry surrounds their production and sale – and like big business, they at once nourish and threaten the democratic spirit that calls them into being. Thousands and thousands of undergraduates pore over (or claim to pore over) their pages to prepare for classwork and exams. What they retain beyond the classroom will help form the reception of western art music in the culture at large.

The danger that superficial information poses to a democratic musical culture was pointed out long ago by, of all people, Arnold Schoenberg. Not long after retiring from UCLA he noted, «I once read in an examination paper of a sophomore, who had studied only a little harmony and much music appreciation, but who had certainly not heard much ‘live’ music, that “Schumann’s orchestration is gloomy and unclear”». ⁷ After reflecting on the complexity of the question and delivering a typically Schoenbergian *boutade* («There is not the same degree of unanimity among experts of orchestration as there is between the sophomore girl and her textbook») he unburdened himself thus:

Irreparable damage has been done; this girl, and probably all her classmates, will never listen to the orchestra of Schumann naively, sensitively, and open-mindedly. At the end of the term she will have acquired a knowledge of music history, aesthetics, and criticism, plus a number of amusing anecdotes; but unfortunately she may not remember even one of those gloomily orchestrated Schumann themes. In a few years she will take her master’s degree in music, or will have become a teacher, or both, and disseminate what she has been taught: ready-made judgments, wrong and superficial ideas about music, musicians, and aesthetics.⁸

⁶ To his list I add the splendid new title, W. HELLER, *Music in the Baroque*, New York, W. W. Norton, 2013 («Western Music in Context: A Norton History»), which appeared in print within days of *Readying Cavalli’s Operas for the Stage*, and which offers an excellent introduction to *Giasona* (pp. 106-108). Heller’s companion volume, *Anthology for Music in the Baroque*, offers score and commentary to Act III, Scene 21 of *Giasona* on pp. 78-90.

⁷ A. SCHOENBERG, *New Music, Outmoded Music, Style and Idea* (1946), in *Style and Idea: Selected Writing of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. by L. Stein, Berkeley - Los Angeles, University of California Press, 1975, pp. 113-124: 113.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 114. Schoenberg’s complaint is also mentioned in J. LESTER, *Schumann and Sonata Forms*, «19th-Century Music», XVIII, 1994/95, pp. 189-210: 189.

To be sure, the sins against Cavalli are more of omission than commission; instead of being misled, students are likely not to be led at all.⁹ The first of Taruskin's three sentences comes in the chapter devoted to early opera:

Scholars now agree that *Pur ti miro*, once thought to be the aged Monteverdi's sublime swan song, was not written by him at all, but by a younger composer (maybe Francesco Cavalli, Monteverdi's pupil; maybe Benedetto Ferrari; maybe Francesco Saccati, now regarded as the prime suspect) for a revival in the early 1650s.¹⁰

The second is found the next chapter, in a section devoted to the cantata:

Ex. 21-15 samples an especially rich cantata, *Lagrima mie* ("My tears"), by the Venetian singer and composer Barbara Strozzi (1619-1677), a pupil of Francesco Cavalli, the foremost Venetian opera composer at midcentury, and the adopted daughter and protégée of Giulio Strozzi, a famous academician and poet-librettist whose words were set by almost every Venetian composer from Monteverdi on down.¹¹

These sentences, retained almost *verbatim* in the *College Edition*, call to mind another witticism, this one attributed to Abraham Mendelssohn, «Formerly I was the son of my father: now I am the father of my son».¹² Thoughtful students may also ask themselves why «the foremost Venetian opera composer at midcentury» has been reduced to the role of one composer's student and another's teacher; less thoughtful ones will likely forget him altogether. Indeed, the brand new edition of another a textbook, aimed at non-majors, has even made sure that students will never be bothered with Cavalli at all. In the penultimate edition of *Listening to Western Music*, Craig Wright declared: «Barbara Strozzi (1619-1677) was steeped in the traditions of Claudio Monteverdi. Her teacher, Francesco Cavalli, was a pupil of Monteverdi, and her father, Giulio Strozzi, wrote librettos for him».¹³ In the latest, recently published, he writes

⁹ Cavalli of course shares this fate with other seventeenth-century composers, who have generally not received the coverage afforded their colleagues from the first half of the eighteenth century. As an opera composer, he is at an extra disadvantage: Monteverdi, Handel, and Gluck are virtually the only such figures before Mozart to receive sufficient treatment in general surveys. Cavalli's religious music, finally, is altogether ignored in such texts, as is the bulk of Italian church composition of the 17th Century ("Seicento").

¹⁰ R. TARUSKIN, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, II: *The Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2005, p. 33.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, p. 75.

¹² The remarks on Cavalli are found in *The Oxford History of Western Music: College Edition* cit., pp. 269, 285. Mendelssohn's quip is cited in S. HENSEL, *Die Familie Mendelssohn (1729-1847): Nach Briefen und Tagebüchern*, Eng. trans. by C. Klingemann, *The Mendelssohn Family (1729-1847): From Letters and Journals*, I, New York, Harper & Brothers, 1882, p. 61.

¹³ C. WRIGHT, *Listening to Western Music*, 6th ed., Boston, Schirmer - Cengage Learning, 2011, p. 109.

instead: «Barbara Strozzi (1619-1677) was steeped in the traditions of opera composer Claudio Monteverdi, for her teacher had been one of his pupils».¹⁴

Instructors can of course step into the pedagogical breach, but many lack the training to do so: again, those who know the American scene know that in many schools music history courses are not taught by music historians. In the event, confusion mounts the third and final time Taruskin mentions Cavalli: two volumes later, in a discussion of Mahler's Second Symphony, he points out a chromatically descending bass line: «Needless to say, Mahler's immediate model was not Monteverdi or Cavalli, but rather the exactly analogous spot – the first-movement coda – in Beethoven's Ninth».¹⁵ Our thoughtful student will wonder where Cavalli used this emblem of lament, since Taruskin has never bothered to say; mercifully, the sentence was cut from the College Edition.

Taruskin's sketchy treatment of Cavalli reflects the composer's tenuous place in the canon; Torrente's point («the study of the music has influenced the editions of Cavalli's operas») is spot on. But the reverse is also true: editions of Cavalli's operas have influenced the study of his music, at least as far as general textbooks are concerned. In choosing Strozzi's *Lagrima mie*, of which he printed three newly set excerpts, Taruskin relied upon a well-known anthology, which has been in print for more than forty years.¹⁶ Now, that anthology also includes «Tremulo spirito», Ecuba's lament from Act I, Scene 7 of Cavalli's *Didone*; Taruskin could easily have included it. But as the editor Carol MacClintock wrote in her commentary to her anthology:

This aria, ... one of the earliest of a type that persisted well into the eighteenth century, has a chromatic ground bass repeated four times. (We may note the similarity of the bass with that of a more famous example: Dido's Lament from Purcell's *Dido and Aeneas*.) A later and more elaborated example of the *lamento aria* may be seen in No. 23 [*Lagrima mie*] by Barbara Strozzi.¹⁷

Whether or not these comments led Taruskin to prefer Strozzi over Cavalli, the attitude they betray toward the composer is echoed in the *Oxford History of Western Music*. Cavalli here becomes a transitional figure, a way station on the

¹⁴ C. WRIGHT, *Listening to Western Music*, 7th ed., Boston, Schirmer - Cengage Learning, 2013, p. 102.

¹⁵ R. TARUSKIN, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, IV: *The Early Twentieth Century*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2005, p. 18. Torrente (*Editing Cavalli's Operas: Fashion or Necessity* cit., p. 24) mistakenly refers to Taruskin having cited Mahler's First Symphony.

¹⁶ TARUSKIN, *The Oxford History of Western Music* cit., II, p. 76 f. His source is *The Solo Song: 1580-1730*, ed. by C. MacClintock, New York, W. W. Norton, 1973, pp. 81-88: his slurred notes, not found in Strozzi's original, match MacClintock's. I reprinted the entire piece from same the edition with commentary. See *The Oxford Anthology of Western Music* cit., I, pp. 321-325.

¹⁷ *The Solo Song: 1580-1730* cit., p. 329. «Tremulo spirito» is found on p. 69 f.

journey to Strozzi's more fully developed music; for Taruskin, he also transmits the teaching of a great figure (Monteverdi) without becoming one himself.¹⁸

Turning to a far more venerable textbook, the one against which *The Oxford History of Western Music: College Edition* aims to compete, we find greater coverage of Cavalli, as well as a clearer if more complex interplay between editions and treatment of his music. Donald Jay Grout's *A History of Western Music*, first published in 1960, has just appeared in its ninth edition, together with the seventh edition of its companion volumes of scores, *The Norton Anthology of Western Music* (hereafter *NAWM*), which consists entirely of reprints of previous editions.¹⁹ Over the course of the book's long editorial history, Grout himself saw the second (1973) and third (1980) edition into print, the latter prepared with the assistance of Claude V. Palisca. In 1980 Palisca also edited the first edition of *NAWM*; subsequent editions of the anthology have since appeared in tandem with new versions of the textbook. A year after Grout's death in 1987 a fourth edition of *A History of Western Music* appeared, with Palisca now listed as co-author. «Grout-Palisca» went through two more editions, the fifth in 1996 and the sixth in 2001. After Palisca's death that year, J. Peter Burkholder became the new author, publishing the seventh and eighth editions in 2006 and 2010, respectively.

Torrente cites this last, noting that it «provides a darker appraisal of Cavalli than its predecessors: the composer only deserves three passing comments in the twenty-four pages [of chapter 14] devoted to “The invention of opera”». ²⁰ He has, however, slightly obscured the matter – the third comment to which he refers appears in the following chapter (“Music for Chamber and Church in the Early Seventeenth Century”), and is actually the fourth.²¹ That which he lists as the first is in fact two comments, found in consecutive paragraphs.²² Torrente further notes, rightly, that Cavalli is later

¹⁸ To be sure, Taruskin's stated reason for including Strozzi was to allow for the discussion of women composers, although he describes the choice as having crowded out discussion of cantatas by Luigi Rossi and Giacomo Carissimi. See *The Oxford History of Western Music* cit., p. 81.

¹⁹ J. P. BURKHOLDER - D. J. GROUT - C. V. PALISCA, *A History of Western Music*, 9th ed., New York, W. W. Norton, 2014, and J. P. BURKHOLDER - C. V. PALISCA, *Norton Anthology of Western Music*, 7th ed., 3 vols., New York, W. W. Norton, 2014.

²⁰ TORRENTE, *Editing Cavalli's Operas: Fashion or Necessity* cit., p. 23. A slight imprecision: in fn. 19 Torrente assigns the date of publication to 2009.

²¹ This fourth comment, newly written by Burkholder, covers familiar ground: «[Barbara Strozzi] studied with Francesco Cavalli, the leading Venetian opera composer and a student of Monteverdi's». See BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. 333; 8th ed., p. 334; and 9th ed., p. 332.

²² The first remark, a considerably shortened version of that found in Grout's and Palisca's editions, will be discussed below. The second was retained from one that

mentioned for his influence on Lully; this is found in chapter 16, “France, England, Spain, and the New World in the Early Seventeenth Century”.²³

Torrente, however, has missed the most striking change in Burkholder’s treatment of Cavalli, one directly related to the lack of decent editions. Burkholder suppressed an excerpt from *Giasone* found in all six previous editions of *A History of Western Music*. The first half of the title character’s aria «Delizie, contenti» had been used to exemplify, in Grout’s words:

Arias [that] unfold in graceful, smoothly flowing phrases supported by simple harmonies, most often in slow triple meter with a single persistent rhythmic motif (Example 79). This bel canto style of vocal writing, a creation of Italian composers, was imitated all over Europe and influenced both vocal and instrumental music throughout the Baroque and after.²⁴

As he had done in a previous textbook, Grout turned to Robert Eitner’s venerable edition of Act I of *Giasone*.²⁵ And as he did with all the examples in *A History of Western Music*, he had the music newly typeset. This allowed him to simplify Eitner’s somewhat unwieldy version, which retained the rhythmic values and irregular barring of its source while providing a continuo realization with halved rhythmic values and regular barring: Grout instead kept the irregular barring, halved the rhythms in all parts, changed *Giasone*’s clef from alto to treble, and offered a new continuo realization.

Palisca added to the 5th edition (p. 323; in this edition Palisca also suppressed a reference to Cavalli that had appeared in previous editions, «[Antonio] Sartorio was one of the last of the Venetians who continued the heroic style of opera established by Monteverdi and Cavalli»), a response to Ellen Rosand’s recently published *Opera in Seventeenth-Century Venice*: «The singers Signora Girolama and Giulia Masotti earned twice to six times as much for an opera’s run as Cavalli, the best-paid opera composer, received for writing it». BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. 322; 8th ed., p. 323; and 9th ed., p. 323. The third, «A copy of a Cavalli opera [*Erismena*] reached England, though no performance is known» (*ibid.*, 7th ed., p. 323; 8th ed., p. 326; 9th ed., p. 323), was newly written by Burkholder.

²³ TORRENTE, *Editing Cavalli’s Operas: Fashion or Necessity* cit., p. 23 fn. 19. See BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. 359; 8th ed., p. 358; and 9th ed., p. 356. The passage was newly written by Burkholder.

²⁴ D. J. GROUT, *A History of Western Music*, New York, W. W. Norton, 1960, pp. 288, 290. The excerpt is printed on p. 288 f. In subsequent editions text and music appear on pp. 318 f. (2nd), 320 f. (3rd), 375-377 (4th), 296 f. (5th), and 282 f. (6th). In the 4th edition the wording of the final phrase was changed to «Baroque period and after»; the 5th and 6th editions have «Baroque period and beyond».

²⁵ See *Die Oper von ihren ersten Anfängen bis zur Mitte des 18. Jahrhunderts*, II: *Francesco Cavalli’s „Il Giasone“ (1649) und Max [sic] Antonio Cesti’s „La Dori“ (1663)*, Berlin, T. Trautwein’sche Hof- Buch- und Musikalienhandlung, 1883 («Publikationen älterer praktischer und theoretischer Musikwerke», XII), pp. 19-21. Grout used the same excerpt in his *A Short History of Opera*, I, New York, Columbia University Press, 1947, p. 93.

But if Eitner's edition supplied Grout and later Palisca with a ready source for Cavalli's music, another edition helped undermine its place in their text. Starting with the third edition, the first for which *NAWM* appeared, the parenthesis in the quote above is expanded: «see also Cesti's *Intorno all'idol mio*, *NAWM* 72». The work in question is an aria from *Oronthea*, reprinted from the complete edition of the opera that William C. Holmes had published a few years before.²⁶ In addition to its quality and chronological proximity to *Giasone*, Cesti's music likely earned its place thanks to the clarity of Holmes's edition: consistent rhythmic values, treble clef for the voice part, numbered measures make a reprint far easier on undergraduate eyes than would one of Eitner's mixed musical text.

It was but a small step, then, for Burkholder to remove Cavalli's music altogether. After all, the composer is not actually named in the excerpt cited above; the prose could simply be retained (with slight revision) without the parenthetical reference to a musical example.²⁷ By contrast, Burkholder wrote a new discussion of *Oronthea*, moving it several paragraphs after the quote and adding an additional excerpt from Holmes's edition, a bit of recitative from the preceding scene preceding the aria.²⁸

The lack of serviceable editions helped eclipse Cavalli in other ways as well. Grout had originally introduced the composer as follows:

One of the leading Venetian opera composers was Monteverdi's pupil, Pier Francesco Cavalli (1602-76). The steady demand for new works at Venice is reflected in the quantity of Cavalli's output. Of his forty-one operas, the most celebrated was *Giasone* (1649), a full-blown score with scenes in which arias and recitatives alternate, though the two styles are always kept carefully distinct. Cavalli's music has neither the fine construction nor the penetrating psychological insight of Monteverdi's: it aims at

²⁶ See A. CESTI, *Oronthea*, ed. by W. C. Holmes, Wellesley, Mass., Wellesley College, 1973 («Wellesley Edition», XI), pp. 158-162; the aria appears in *NAWM*, I, pp. 362-366. In the three subsequent editions Palisca prepared it is found in vol. 1, pp. 380-384; vol. 1, pp. 306-311; and vol. 1, pp. 315-321.

²⁷ It now reads «melodious aria that unfold in graceful, smoothly flowing phrases supported by simple harmonies, often in triple meter with a persistent rhythmic motive. This lyrical style of vocal writing was imitated all over Europe and also influenced instrumental music throughout the following centuries». BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. 322; 8th ed., p. 323; and 9th ed., p. 322.

²⁸ See BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., pp. 323, 326; 8th ed., p. 326 f.; and 9th ed., pp. 323, 326 f. The expanded score excerpts are found in *NAWM*, 5th ed., I, pp. 433-441; 6th ed., I, pp. 445-452; and 7th ed., I, pp. 488-495. It should also be noted that it was Burkholder who finally corrected Grout and Palisca's errors concerning Cesti's name («Antonio» instead of «Marc'Antonio») and the date of *Oronthea* (1656 instead of 1649).

broad striking effects and is best in scenes of violence and passion, as in the celebrated “Incantation” sung by the sorceress Medea in the first act of *Giasona*.²⁹

Grout continued to expand the passage in response to new developments in performance and scholarship. In the second edition he inserted a new sentence between the penultimate and the last: «Two other Cavalli operas, *Ormindo* (1644) and *Calisto* (1651), have been recently revived, with alterations and additions that would probably have astonished the composer».³⁰ He was of course alluding to Raymond Leppard’s Glyndebourne productions of 1967 and 1970, which in turn led to published editions, the first of which, *Ormindo*, was in print by the time Grout wrote.³¹

The considerable defects of Leppard’s *Ormindo* edition – cuts, revisions, added instruments – likely kept excerpts of it out of Grout’s second edition; the same can be said of Leppard’s *Calisto*, which appeared in 1975, in regards to the third edition. In the latter, however, the new penultimate sentence was expanded to take into account one of Leppard’s subsequent efforts, his 1974 Santa Fe production of *Egisto*: «Three other Cavalli operas, *Egisto* (1643), *Ormindo* (1644), and *Calisto* (1651) ...». Leppard also published a no less problematic edition of *Egisto* in 1977. However, a better version of excerpts of the work had appeared in print a few years earlier, and it was this that allowed Grout (now working with Palisca) to do more with the opera. Their discussion of the composer now continued:

Cavalli’s recitative lacks the variety and psychological shadings of Monteverdi’s, but it is still rich in dramatic and pathetic touches. The arias are much more developed and are true set pieces. One of the most famous is the lament of Climene in *Egisto* (NAWM 71); it must have contributed to solidify the topos of the ground-bass lament, of which it is an exemplary specimen. The four-measure descending tetrachord bass is repeated eighteen times. At first the voice comes to a stop at the end of each statement of the bass, but as Climene becomes more agitated, the lines overlap the seams of the ground, and chains of suspensions renew the tension at each downbeat. At the other extreme, Cavalli is capable of bringing down the house with his comic scenes in today’s revivals of *Ormindo*. He was a remarkably versatile composer.³²

²⁹ GROUT, *A History of Western Music* cit., p. 282 f. Once again, Grout revisited his earlier treatment Act I of *Giasona*, having discussed and excerpted the incantation scene in *A Short History of Opera* cit., I, p. 94 f.

³⁰ GROUT, *A History of Western Music* cit., 2nd ed., p. 312.

³¹ F. CAVALLI, *Ormindo*, ed. by R. Leppard, London, Faber Music, 1969.

³² D. J. GROUT - C. V. PALISCA, *A History of Western Music*, 3rd ed., New York, W. W. Norton, 1980, p. 313 f. As luck would have it, this was the edition chosen for translation into Italian, and thus the extended treatment of Cavalli was kept in print for more than twenty years. See D. J. GROUT, *Storia della musica in Occidente*, trans. by A. Melchiorre, Milan, Feltrinelli, 1984. A tenth and final appeared printing in 2005.

Palisca reprinted the aria «Piangete occhi dolenti» from Act II Scene 6 in *NAWM* from an edition prepared for a study of seventeenth-century Italian music.³³ This straightforward version, rather than Leppard's wildly over-interpreted one, allowed Grout and him to discuss both recent stage revivals of Cavalli's music and the composer's mastery of the ground-bass lament.

None of this was to last. Palisca cut the discussion of *Egisto* from the fourth edition of the text, and removed the aria from the second edition of *NAWM*.³⁴ To illustrate the descending tetrachord lament, he chose a more celebrated work, one that is easier to teach to English speakers. But the decision to add «When I am laid in earth» from Henry Purcell's *Dido and Aeneas* to the new edition of *NAWM*, and expand the discussion of same in *A History of Western Music* was almost certainly conditioned by the easy availability of an authoritative edition.³⁵ In 1986 the publisher of «Grout-Palisca» reprinted the Purcell Society edition of the entire opera in its series of critical scores.³⁶

The fourth, fifth, and sixth editions of *A History of Western Music*, then, provide a much shorter introduction to Cavalli than do their predecessors: both the discussion of *Egisto* and the citation of the incantation scene in *Giasone* (which Palisca had already removed from the third edition) are gone. When Burkholder assumed authorship of the text he further shortened the passage, removing allusions to Leppard's no-longer-recent productions. Students are now left with a telegraphic introduction to the composer:

Among the leading Venetian opera composers were Francesco Cavalli (1602-1676), a pupil of Monteverdi's and organist at St. Mark's, and Antonio Cesti (1623-1669). The most celebrated of Cavalli's over thirty operas was *Giasone* (Jason, 1649), whose arias exemplify the lyric style. Cesti, who also excelled in lyrical arias and duets, was Cavalli's most serious competitor but spent much of his career abroad.³⁷

Good or at least serviceable editions of the music of Francesco Cavalli have thus proved a necessary if not sufficient condition for earning the composer a place in some of the most widely read introductory texts in Music

³³ See F. TESTI, *La musica italiana nel Seicento*, I: *Il melodramma*, Milan, Bramante Editrice, 1970, p. 300 f. The aria is reprinted in *NAWM*, pp. 359-361. For Leppard's version see F. CAVALLI, *Egisto*, ed. by R. Leppard, London, Faber Music, 1977, pp. 93-96.

³⁴ Palisca's shorter discussion of Cavalli is found in *A History of Western Music* cit., 4th ed., p. 370; 5th ed., p. 292; and 6th ed., p. 277.

³⁵ See *NAWM*, 2nd ed., I, pp. 401-403; 3rd ed., I, pp. 410-412; 4th ed., I, pp. 414-416; 5th ed., I, pp. 538-540; 6th ed., I, pp. 600-602; and 7th ed., I, pp. 640-642.

³⁶ See H. PURCELL, *Dido and Aeneas: An Opera*, ed. by C. Price, New York, W. W. Norton, 1986 («Norton Critical Scores»). The lament is found on pp. 176-178. Price reprinted the score from H. PURCELL, *Dido and Aeneas*, ed. by M. Laurie and T. Dart, London, Novello & Co., 1979 («The Works of Henry Purcell», III).

³⁷ BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. 322; 8th ed., p. 323; and 9th ed., p. 322.

History. For example, each of Burkholder's editions has been preceded by the appearance of an important critical edition of a Cavalli opera, *La Doriclea* in 2004, *La Calisto* in 2007, and another *La Calisto* in 2012.³⁸ Yet Burkholder mentions none of these, either in the text or in the bibliographical essay ("For Further Reading") at the back of the book; he has instead cited Leppard's three deeply flawed editions.³⁹

Let us not, though, be discouraged by the oversights of Taruskin, Burkholder, and others: these may be remedied in future editions. Twelve more critical editions of Cavalli's operas are in preparation, and these will influence the treatment of the composer, either directly or, more likely still, indirectly.⁴⁰

³⁸ See F. CAVALLI, *La Doriclea*, ed. by C. J. Mossey, Middleton, Wis., A-R Editions, 2004 («Recent Researches in the Music of the Baroque Era», 132); ID., *La Calisto*, ed. by J. W. Brown, Middleton, Wis., A-R Editions, 2007 («Collegium Musicum», II/16); and ID., *La Calisto*, ed. by Á. Torrente and N. Badolato, Kassel, Bärenreiter, 2012 («Francesco Cavalli: Opere», 1). Another critical edition, F. CAVALLI, *Artemisia*, ed. by H. Schulze and S. E. Stangalino, Kassel, Bärenreiter, 2013 («Francesco Cavalli: Opere», 2), was published too late for inclusion in the 9th edition of *A History of Western Music*, whose Preface (pp. XXXI-XLII) is dated October 2013.

³⁹ See BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., p. A40; 8th ed., p. A42; and 9th ed., p. A44. Burkholder also cites Eitner's edition of *Giasona* and the inclusion of Cavalli operas in the series *Italian Opera, 1640-1770*, ed. by H. M. Brown, New York, Garland, 1977-1984. By contrast, Alessandro Scarlatti had the good fortune to have both an edition and Grout's advocacy working in his favor. In 1974 Grout launched «The Operas of Alessandro Scarlatti». Palisca reprinted the aria «Mi rivedi, o selva ombrosa» from *Griselda*, the third volume of the series (ed. by D. J. Grout, Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1975 («Harvard Publications in Music», VIII), pp. 105-107), in the first edition of *NAWM* (I, pp. 391-394); it remained in the three subsequent editions that he produced (2nd ed., I, pp. 412-415; 3rd ed., I, pp. 395-398; 4th ed., I, pp. 395-398). Grout and Palisca also rewrote the treatment of the composer found in the first two editions of *A History of Western Music* (pp. 313-315 and 345-347, respectively). They replaced a brief discussion of *Eraclea*, which included an excerpt of the aria «Ricordati, ch'io t'amo», in favor of a more detailed description of the aria from *Griselda*; this, too, remained in Palisca's subsequent editions. See GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 3rd ed., p. 345 f.; 4th ed., p. 409 f.; 5th ed., pp. 327-329; and 6th ed., p. 313 f. For his part Burkholder at first suppressed the opera in favor of excerpts from Scarlatti's cantata «Clori vezzosa, e bella» (see *NAWM*, 5th ed., I, pp. 567-572), which he discussed in BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 7th ed., pp. 387-389. He then thought better of it, restoring another aria from *Griselda*, «In voler ciò che tu brami», to the next edition and printing it immediately after the cantata excerpts (see *NAWM*, 6th ed., I, pp. 635-641; 7th ed., I, pp. 675-681). He discusses both works, albeit with an emphasis on the cantata, in BURKHOLDER - GROUT - PALISCA, *A History of Western Music* cit., 8th ed., pp. 386-390; 9th ed., pp. 381-383.

⁴⁰ See the publication schedule for «Francesco Cavalli: Opere» listed at <https://www.baerenreiter.com/en/program/complete-editions/francesco-cavalli-opere/overview-of-volumes/>.

As Dinko Fabris pointed out at the same conference for which this article was originally conceived, the Cavalli revival of the last half century began when enterprising conductors or producers commissioned private editions or made their own; the new editions that are now appearing in print have begun to reverse this dynamic, as opera houses and recording companies turn to them for new repertory.⁴¹ More performances can not but help Cavalli's case in the world of general textbooks; we have seen how Leppard's productions increased his coverage in *A History of Western Music*. Paul Griffiths has noted in his introductory text that the «veneration of Haydn and Mozart», which consigned so much of eighteenth-century to obscurity, «was a harsh thinning, and its effects were to linger, for the operas of Cavalli proved easier to revive than those of Hasse or Martín y Soler».⁴² And in a title published just last year, James Parakilas has devoted nearly a third of a twenty-five page chapter («Opera in Commercial Opera Houses: Venice») to *Giasono*: the opera is even presented before Monteverdi's *L'incoronazione di Poppea*, as emblematic of seventeenth-century sensibilities.⁴³ Credit for this choice goes in good part to the Yale Baroque Opera Project's production of 2009 – Parakilas has even included a photograph from it – which was given in conjunction with a conference on the opera that gave rise to the book of essays cited at the opening and launched the edition upon which I pin my hopes.⁴⁴ I thus close with another feature of American life, optimism, in the hope new editions will help the second edition of *The Oxford History of Western Music: College Edition*, the tenth of *A History of Western Music*, and (perhaps) the eighth of *NAWM* to be more generous in their treatment of the life and work of Francesco Cavalli.

⁴¹ Fabris's remarks were part of the session «Per Ellen Rosand: Presentazione del volume *L'opera a Venezia nel XVII secolo: nascita di un genere* (Roma, Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 2013) e di altre recenti monografie ed edizioni dedicate a Francesco Cavalli e all'opera veneziana del Seicento» (Bologna, May 14 2014).

⁴² P. GRIFFITHS, *A Concise History of Western Music*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2006, p. 149. Torrente (*Editing Cavalli's Operas: Fashion or Necessity* cit., p. 24) cites Griffiths, too, but only to criticize his brief mention of the composer's influence on Lully.

⁴³ J. PARAKILAS, *The Story of Opera*, New York, W. W. Norton, 2013, pp. 129-136.

⁴⁴ This was *Manuscript, Edition, Production: Readyng Cavalli's Operas for the Stage*, Conference at the Whitney Humanities Center, April 30 - May 2 2009.